“The Bloggs Cases”

Text and drawings © 2017 by Rob Streiffer and Gary Varner

Note: College faculty or other teachers have our permission to link to this document or reproduce it for non-commercial distribution only, and this copyright statement must be kept intact.

The Scarce drug case: You are an emergency room physician, and you only have five doses of a certain drug left. Alas, you have six patients who need it. Bloggs has a very severe version of the condition for which the drug is a treatment, and it will take all five doses of the drug to cure him. Your other five patients have mild versions of the condition, and each of them will be cured by a single dose. Any one of the six who doesn’t get the full dosage they need will die. What would be the right thing to do?

☐ Give one dose to each of the other five.
☐ Give all five doses to Bloggs.

Transplant case: Suppose that you are a famous transplant surgeon, and that your transplants always work. You have five patients, each of whom needs a transplant. One needs a heart, one a lung, one a liver, and two need one kidney apiece. One of your patients, Bloggs, has come in today to find out the results from some lab work. You know from the results of the lab work that Bloggs would be a perfect donor for each of your five other patients, and you know that there are no other available donors. So you ask Bloggs if he would be willing to be cut up and have his organs distributed. He declines your kind offer, but you realize that you could easily overpower Bloggs and cut him up without his consent, and that no one would find out. What would be the right thing to do?

☐ Overpower Bloggs and transplant to the other five.
☐ Don’t overpower Bloggs and let the others die.

Trolley case #1: The driver of a trolley has passed out at the wheel, and his trolley is hurtling out of control down the track. Straight ahead on the track are five people who will be killed if the trolley reaches them. You are a passerby, who happens to be standing by the track next to a switch. If you throw the switch, you will turn the trolley onto a spur of track on the right, thereby saving the five. But Bloggs is on that spur of track on the right; and he will be killed if you turn the trolley. What would be the right thing to do?

☐ Throw the switch.
☐ Don’t throw the switch.

Continued on reverse
Trolley case #2: The driver of a trolley has passed out at the wheel, and his trolley is hurtling out of control down the track. Straight ahead on the track are five people who will be killed if the trolley reaches them. You are standing on an adjacent platform next to a very large man named Bloggs. If you push Bloggs off the platform onto the track, his body will stop the trolley, and although he will be killed, the five will survive. What would be the right thing to do?
- Push Bloggs off onto the track.
- Don’t push Bloggs off onto the track.

Trolley case #3: The driver of a trolley has passed out at the wheel, and his trolley is hurtling out of control down the track. Straight ahead on the track are five people who will be killed if the trolley reaches them. You are a passerby, who happens to be standing by the track next to a switch. If you throw the switch, you will turn the trolley onto a spur of track on the right. That spur curves back around to where the five are, but a very large man named Bloggs is on that spur of track. He will be killed if the trolley hits him, but that will stop the trolley from continuing back around and killing the five. If you don’t throw the switch, the trolley will hit and kill the five, but that will stop it from hitting Bloggs. What would be the right thing to do?
- Throw the switch.
- Don’t throw the switch.

Trolley case #4: This case is identical to the preceding case, except that if you do not throw the switch, then the five people will be killed, without, however, stopping the trolley that will then go on to kill Bloggs.
- Throw the switch.
- Don’t throw the switch.
### Survey: Your Answers to “The Bloggs Cases”

Name: ____________________________

**Scarce drug case:**
- □ Give one dose to each of the other five.
- □ Give all five doses to Bloggs.

**Transplant case:**
- □ Overpower Bloggs and transplant to the other five.
- □ Don’t overpower Bloggs and let the others die.

**Tolley case #1:**
- □ Throw the switch.
- □ Don’t throw the switch.

**Trolley case #2:**
- □ Push Bloggs off onto the track.
- □ Don’t push Bloggs off onto the track.

**Trolley case #3:**
- □ Throw the switch.
- □ Don’t throw the switch.

**Trolley case #4:**
- □ Throw the switch.
- □ Don’t throw the switch.