Organizational research has shown over the past several years that personal strengths actually become weaknesses when taken too far (Pierce & Aguinis, 2013). The literature points in the direction of an ‘optimal level’, whereby underdoing (‘deficiency’) as well as overdoing (‘overkill’) explain lowered performance or productivity. In this talk, I discuss the results from two studies that use the Too Little – Too Much (TLTM) rating format to assess leader behavior. In Study 1, the properties of this rating format are compared against a more standard Likert-type rating format. In study 2, the TLTM-rating format is used to explain the curvilinear relationship between leader charismatic personality and effectiveness.